

Why the world is trying to develop new farming technologies

Multiexport Foods Conference 24 April 2019 | DNB Markets

Alexander Aukner, (Analyst) +47 24 16 90 79, alexander.aukner@dnb.no



It appears traditional farming supply is struggling to grow...



Global supply of Atlantic Salmon (tonnes, wfe), 3Y average growth

DNB 2 | markets

Source: Kontali (historical data) DNB Markets (further calculations)

Demand will ensure new production methods emerge







Who, where and what can replace net pen farming?

Existing regions





New regions developed with existing technology by existing players

New regions



Iceland and Eastern Canada developing...

...but even when fully developed unlikely to represent more than ~10% of production



Source: Mowi Industry Handbook 2018, DNB Markets

New regions have not been able to capture any market share



Source: Kontali (historical data) DNB Markets (further calculations)

New regions have not been able to capture any market share

Market share of producing regions



Chile is the only region to take meaningful market share in the last 20 years

With current farming technology, new regions are too small to make a difference



Source: Kontali (historical data) DNB Markets (further calculations)

Evolution - New technology could expand existing regions...

Existing technology and farming regions





Evolution - ...and open new ones

Evolution of existing sea-based technologies



Evolution through offshore in <u>existing</u> regions by <u>existing</u> players....

However, China may become a new region



Revolution - Land based to redefine salmon farming geography

Revolution with regards to where one can farm salmon



Revolution...

No real limitations on locations...



DNB Markets has produced two reports on land-based farming





DNB

Onshore farming – Revolution or a big, expensive dead end...

Opportunities

- Industrialisation potential
- Lower environmental impact
- Improved biological security
- Lower mortality and faster growth
- Transport advantage
 - Product faster to market
 - Reduced transport cost
 - Lower CO2 footprint
- Turning waste into an asset

Challenges

- High investment need
- Energy-intensive production
- Fish welfare with high density
- Operational risk H2S



Land-based farming – Poland, Switzerland and Denmark













Land-based farming – US, Canada and Dubai











Source: DNB Markets

Overview of land-based facilities



Source: DNB Markets

 \otimes

۲



Reasons for looking at land-based salmon farming, defined two years ago, are still valid

1

Improved visibility on pricing – stronger for longer means less probability of a collapse in prices before land-based volumes hit the market. We estimate a salmon price of NOK60/kg in 2019 and NOK59/kg in 2020.

In-sea production costs rising – NOK5/kg increase just in sea-lice-related costs. Average production costs have not come down, but look fairly 'stable and high'.

3 Increasing 'upfront investment' for traditional growth – licence prices increasing. In the latest auctions in Norway, but appetite for licences was high, with the traffic-light auction implying a figure of ~NOK120/kg.

4

Improved 'new' land-based technology – enables increased scale and quality issues are addressed. The large equipment providers and salmon farmers report sizeable investments in recirculating aquaculture systems (RAS).

5

Demand in remote markets picking up – land-based farming has an advantage in transport and freshness if production is close to the end-consumer. US consumption of salmon is continuing to rise, while prices in Miami were fairly stable throughout 2018.



Surge in land-based driven by higher traditional capex



Investments in land based used to be 2x more expensive than traditional growth. Now the situation has reversed



Source: Directorate of Fisheries, DNB Markets estimates



Surge in land-based driven by higher traditional capex

Investments in land based used to be 2x more expensive than traditional growth. Now the situation has reversed



Source: Directorate of Fisheries, DNB Markets estimates

Grieg Seafood - Investment need for traditional growth skyrocketing

Investment per kilo

(NOK/kg HOG)	Expanding current MAB	Onshore expansion	New licences
License	-	-	122*
Smolt phase	6	6	6
Post smolt and farming phase	30	75	30
Primary processing	9	9	9_
Total investments	45	90	167
Biomass/Working Capital	25	25	25
Total funding need	70	115	192

Grieg Seafood – Capital Markets Day 5th September 2018



Source: Grieg Seafood Capital Markets Day 2018

Transport advantage gives margin of safety in US and Asia



Transportation costs at NOK13–18/kg from Norway to US and Asia



Source: DNB Markets estimates

Current plans versus where we were two years ago





Volumes have been pushed out in time, and some projects will probably never materialise

Source: Company information (on volumes in total and distribution if available), DNB Markets(estimate on distribution if not available)



Bill Gates describes our view on the land-based salmon well

Expectations vs. change



We overestimate the change that will occur in the next two years and underestimate what will change in the next ten



Source: https://abcnews.go.com/Technology/PCWorld/story?id=5214635

A friendly reminder from the unconventional oil supply development



Steep increase in volumes from take-off and improved efficency

Source: US Energy Information Administration (EIA), Range Resources (Cost & Efficiency improvement - Northern Marcellus)



Breakdown of identified plan of production in 2016 vs. 2019 (HOG, kt)



We see larger and more projects within land-based salmon farming than before

Source: Company information (on volumes in total and distribution if available), DNB Markets (estimate on distribution if not available). Please note that there are probably a large amount of projects that we are not aware of



Developments totalling ~500kt in annual production by 2026

Land-based volumes identified, kt



~530kt corresponds to ~20% of global salmon production

* Including assumed identified

Source: Company information (on volumes in total and distribution if available), DNB Markets(estimate on distribution if not available)



... And larger and more 'sophisticated' projects

Land-based volumes identified, kt



Impressive pipeline of projects

Source: Company information (on volumes in total and distribution if available), DNB Markets(estimate on distribution if not available)



40+ projects with average planned output of 10kt





Source: DNB Markets

Land-based - Scale lowers the investment cost per kg



Scale important for both production and investment cost per kg



Source: DNB Markets, Publicly available sources

We have identified +40 projects with a planned output of 523kt





Source: DNB Markets (own research and own estimates)

From PowerPoint presentations and excel sheets to reality....



We see a handful of projects with ambitious volumes whereof one has started construction



Source: Atlantic Sapphire

But 10 years from start-up to commercial-sized harvest volume





Source: Atlantic Sapphire

Atlantic Sapphire in US: Fish moved to start-feeding in Feb. 2019





Land-based farming is complicated

Numerous factors impacting the salmon...

...have led to challenges



1	Bacteria and disease
2	High CO2 level
3	Early maturation
4	Water quality and clarity
5	Off flavour
6	Component failure





Source: DNB Markets, Langsand (presentation held at Freshwater Institute)

Different risk profile vs. traditional farming





Source: DNB Markets

RAS development from other species to full-size salmon



Source: Billund aquaculture(projects), DNB Markets (estimate on size on some of the facilities when confidential)



Offshore farming – Evolution rather than revolution





Offshore farming – Evolution rather than revolution

Opportunities

- Limit impact on coastal environment
- Increase the available areas for aquaculture production
- Better dispersion of biological waste
- Less challenges with sea-lice
- Improved biological security (greater distance between farms)
- · Lower 'proof of concept' risk compared to e.g. land-based farming
- More natural farming environment for the salmon

Challenges

- Harsher weather requires tougher equipment
- Higher investment cost compared to near-shore equipment
- Higher logistics cost
- Still exposed to weather, sea temperatures and other 'uncontrollable factors'
- * Possibly higher production cost than near-shore farming

*We assume the absolute cost should be higher due to longer supply distance, more advanced equipment and higher requirement for safety features on the facility. However, improved growth/yield due to better farming conditions may mitigate the higher absolute cost, leading to similar or even lower production cost per kg than we see in traditional farming nearshore.



Offshore farming works in Norway...

Figure 47: SalMar - Ocean Farm 1



Source: DNB Markets

- Successful completion of first production cycle with 1 million individuals
- ^{2nd} bigger unit, 'Smart Fish Farm' to be built following award of eight development licences
- 'Smart Fish Farm' capable of holding 3 million salmon, 2x the capacity of 'Ocean Farm 1'



SalMar - Smart Fish Farm



...but many of the traditional challenges remain



www.BarentsWatch.com



BarentsWatch.com

- Operates close to the coast
- Escape due to human error (~16.000 fish)
- Sea-lice present, but no need for lice treatment
- Suspected ISA
- OceanFarm design may not be what SalMar picks going forward...



Offshore farming also works in China



Shenlan 1



Source: CGTN, www.youtube.com

Source: www.ccccisc.com

- Successful completion of first production cycle
- China Construction and Communication Company CCCC won the tender to build a second unit, Shenlan-2, "Laying the foundation for further development of marine fishery resource development"



...but there are also challenges here



Shenlan 1



Source: CGTN, www.youtube.com

Source: www.ccccisc.com

- Towing to site and mooring delayed due to weather
- Volatile feeding due to high water temperature and other fish swimming into cage
- 2nd smolt stocking with higher density planned



Offshore growth in existing regions due to infrastructure advantage

Evolution of existing sea based technologies



... but China may become a new region



Offshore farming in China



- Bottom cages in Yellow Sea (rigs)
- Deep water from South China Sea (vessels)
- North/South Korea



_	Applicant	MAB	Туре	Status
1	SalMar - OceanFarm	6,240	Offshore Rig	Approved
2	Nordlaks	16,380	Offshore Vessel	Approved
3	Norway Royal Salmon	5,990	Arctic Offshore Rig	Approved
4	SalMar - Smart Fish Farm	6,240	Offshore Rig	Approved
5	Måsøval Fiskeoppdrett	3,900	Semi submersible facility	Pending
6	Pelaqua Farming	22,620	Offshore Fish Cage	Under review
7	Unitech Salmo Solar	3,120	Floating in exposed locations	Under review
8	Mowi	28,080	Aqua Storm' Offshore subsea	Under review
9	Floating Fish Farming Unit	7,800	Offshore farming	Under review
10	Gigante Offshore	6,240	Offshore Vessel	Rejections
11	Gifas Marine	3,120	Submersible cage	Rejections
12	Lerlow	6,240	Semi-offshore	Rejections
13	Mowi 1	4,680	Beck cage offshore	Rejections
14	Bremnes Seashore	4,680	Offshore concept	Rejections
15	Mowi	4,680	Farming in vessels	Rejections
16	Viewpoint Seafarm/Nordlaks	15,600	Modular Oceanfarm	Rejections
17	Erko Seafarms	12,480	Bottom structure offshore	Rejections
18	Nova Sea	3,120	Closed offshore facility	Rejections
19	Gigant Offshore	7,020	Offshore cage	Rejections
20	Mowi 2	4,680	Beck cage offshore	Rejections
21	Roxel Aqua	10,920	Submersible in Offshore	Rejections
22	Offshore Salmon	5,460	Submersible Offshore	Rejections
23	Mohn Drilling	4,680	Autonomous oceanfarming	Rejections
24	Wilsgård Fiskeoppdrett	8,580	Offshore tank fleet	Rejections
25	Evna	7,800	Wave Master	Rejections
26	Inocap/Subsea farming	4,680	Farming in exposed areas	Rejections

Development licenses
- 26 offshore project
applications in
Norway...

 Projects may be rejected in Norway but still relevant in other regions



Source: DNB Markets, Directory of Fisheries

Offshore projects



Another key feature of De Maas' design is it is submersible; before a storm arrives, the pen submerges so that it gets out of the 'wave zone', where the force of waves acting on the pen is strongest. ZNO ZNO ZN

Source: DNB Markets, Undercurrent News



Offshore projects



Source: DNB Markets, Undercurrent News

Meanwhile, the firm has also built 26 'mini jack-ups' for farmers to reside on or store farming equipment next to near-shore or offshore aquaculture pens, and which resemble mini-rigs. CIMC Blue was promoting all three designs at CFSE in early November.





Offshore projects



Source: DNB Markets, Undercurrent News

Another offshore pen concept aiming to exploit cold water mass in the Yellow Sea is Chinese firm Neptune Blue Ocean Development's (NBOD) offshore salmon farm near Weihai. Established by entrepreneur Wang Lingyu, NBOD plans eight semi-submersible pens built at a cost of \$150 million to farm salmon.





Offshore projects





Source: DNB Markets, Undercurrent News



Offshore projects



Source: DNB Markets, Undercurrent News

First release of fish by summer 2020 (2mill individuals)



Offshore projects

INA EXPO 2018 ATLANTIC SALMON ASIA

Why China is a hub for building offshore aquaculture pens

By Louis Harkell Oct. 2, 2018 09:13 GMT



SalMar's Ocean Farm 1 under construction in Qingdao, China. Credit: People's Daily

Hyundai studies Nordlaks Havfarm model as it considers entry into aquaculture

By Matt Craze Jan. 4, 2019 10:31 GMT



Hyundai Heavy Industries, the world's largest shipbuilder, is considering venturing into aquaculture and has taken inspiration from a Norwegian design to store fish on a huge ship.







Source: DNB Markets, Directory of Fisheries, Undercurrent News

What do the numbers tell us?

	New technology			Traditional		
Per kg (wfe, NOK)	Land based Offshore			Ex - license	Incl. License	
Investment	100	80		45	167	
Required return	10%	10%		10%	10%	
Required EBIT/kg	10	8		5	17	
Production cost	40	35		35	35	
Required salmon price	50	43		40	52	



What do the numbers tell us?

	New technology			Traditional		
Perkg (wfe, NOK)	Land based Offshore		_	Ex - license	Incl. License	
Investment	100	80		45	167	
Required return	10%	10%		10%	10%	
Required EBIT/kg	10	8		5	17	
Production cost	40	35		35	35	
Required salmon price	50	43		40	52	

	New tech	inology		Traditional	
Perkg (wfe, NOK)	Land based	Offshore	Ex - license Incl. License		
Required salmon price	50	50	50	50	
Freight	0	10	10	10	
Price from farmer	50	40	40	40	
Production cost	40	35	35	35	
EBIT/kg	10	5	5	5	
Investment	100	80	45	167	
Return on Investment	10%	6%	11%	3%	



What do the numbers tell us?

	New techr	nology	Traditional		
Per kg (wfe, NOK)	Land based Offshore		Ex - license	Incl. License	
Investment	100	80	45	167	
Required return	10%	10%	10%	10%	
Required EBIT/kg	10	8	5	17	
Production cost	40	35	35	35	
Required salmon price	50	43	40	52	

	New technology			Traditional		
Perkg (wfe, NOK)	Land based	Offshore	Ex - license	Incl. License	Ex transport	
Required salmon price	50	50	50	50	50	
Freight	0	10	10	10	0	
Price from farmer	50	40	40	40	50	
Production cost	40	35	35	35	35	
EBIT/kg	10	5	5	5	15	
Investment	100	80	45	167	167	
Return on Investment	10%	6%	11%	3%	9%	



New technology could lead to local markets due to freight cost

Regional market development



Local market

- North America
- South America
- Europe
- Asia
- Australia



New technology could lead to local markets due to freight cost

Regional market development





Concluding remarks

- If traditional growth fails to satisfy demand, new technology will emerge
- Norway and Chile still essential in supplying the market
- Offshore is evolution existing regions, low risk, but still challenges
- Onshore is revolution new regions, but still with high risk
- New technology will create local markets for commodity products
- Brands, origin and quality to play a more important role

Key to success is ability and willingness to adapt if the rules change



Disclaimer

This presentation is strictly confidential and prepared exclusively for the benefit and internal use of our client to whom it is directly addressed and delivered (including such client's subsidiaries, the "Company") and not for distribution or publication. The information may not be reproduced without the consent of DNB Markets.

The information in this presentation is based upon any management forecasts supplied to us by the Company and publicly available information. We have relied upon and assumed, without independent verification, the accuracy and completeness of all information available. DNB Markets opinions and estimates constitute DNB Markets' judgment and should be regarded as indicative, preliminary and for illustrative purposes only. Statements in the presentation reflect prevailing conditions and DNB Markets' opinion at the date the presentation was prepared, all of which are accordingly subject to change. DNB Markets does not warrant that the information in the presentation is exact, correct or complete. The presentation is for discussion purposes only and is incomplete without reference to, and should be viewed solely in conjunction with, oral briefing provided by DNB Markets.

Our analyses are not and do not purport to be appraisals of the assets, shares, or business of the Company or any other entity. DNB Markets makes no representation as to the actual value which may be received in connection with a transaction nor the legal, tax or accounting effects of consummating a transaction. Unless expressly contemplated hereby, the information in this presentation does not take into account the effects of a possible transaction or transactions involving an actual or potential change of control, which may have significant valuation and other effects.

This presentation is not an offer or a recommendation to purchase or sell financial instruments or assets, and does not constitute a commitment by DNB Markets to underwrite, subscribe for or place any securities or to extend or arrange credit to or to provide any other services. DNB Markets does not accept any responsibility for direct or indirect losses that are due to the interpretation, and/or use, of this presentation.

DNB Bank ASA and/or other companies in the DNB group or employees and/or officers in the group may be market makers, trade or hold positions in instruments referred to or connected therewith, or provide financial advice and banking services in this connection.

Rules regarding confidentiality and other internal rules limit the exchange of information between different units in DNB Bank. Employees in DNB Markets who have prepared this presentation are therefore prevented from using, or being aware of, information in DNB Bank and other companies in the DNB group which may be relevant to this presentation.

This presentation has been prepared in accordance with the general business terms of DNB Markets, a division of DNB Bank ASA, available at dnb.no/markets.

